June 15, 2016
Historic Architectural Review Board Minutes
Borough of Gettysburg

Chair Gary Shaffer called the Historic Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 PM on Wednesday, June 15, 2016. The meeting was held at the Borough Municipal Building, 59 East High Street. A quorum was present. Those in attendance were: Board members Peggy Gustafson, Jim McCabe, Phil Goble, Joan Hodges, Colleen Lingle and Clem Malot, Gettysburg Building Code Official; and Karen Mesher, Borough Management Assistant. Also in attendance were: Marianne Larkin of 233 North Stratton Street, representing 231 North Stratton Street; Robert A. Sharrah of Sharrah Design Restoration & Construction (SDGI), LLC, representing 533 Steinwehr Avenue; Sharon Hamm, Administrative Services Manager, PA Municipal Code Alliance; and Susan Naugle, Gettysburg Borough Councilor.

Mr. Malot announced that Borough Planning Director Scott Dellett resigned his position on June 10, 2016; and that as the Gettysburg Building Code Official and appointed Zoning Hearing Officer, he along with his staff at PA Municipal Code Alliance (PMCA), will coordinate the functions of the Historical Architectural Review Board until that position is filled. He introduced Ms. Hamm to the Board, and announced that Mindy Crawford from Preservation Pennsylvania will serve as a consultant to PMCA and to the HARB Board.

Review of Agenda and Minutes

There were no additions or corrections to the meeting agenda. Mr. Goble made the **motion** to approve the minutes of the May 18, 2016 meeting. Seconded by Mr. McCabe. Motion carried 7-to-0.

Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

There were no public comments for items not on the meeting agenda.

New Applications for Application for Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Shaffer introduced the members and explained the procedures that would be followed during the meeting. He noted that the Board serves as an advisory group to Borough Council, which makes the final decision concerning the issuance of Certificates of Appropriateness. Borough Council will next meet on Monday, July 11, 2016.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the next applicant, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as chair.

A. **COA-16-37 James E. Simpson, 231 North Stratton Street. Replace the existing asphalt shingles with architectural asphalt shingles; repair the existing gutter and downspout;**

clean and paint the existing non-painted stucco and exposed concrete surfaces below the stucco.

Mr. Malot gave background information of the building as presented in the packet. Mr. Shaffer gave a brief history of the house, indicating that the brickyard area was added to the original house after the battle, and is not a Civil War structure. Ms. Larkin did note that a 1906 signature was found in the attic. He said that the building was stuccoed early on to prevent deterioration of the brick masonry due to water penetration. He said that the stucco had the original coloring, showed evidence of pebble and a mixed-in color, and had never been painted. He noted that it would be difficult to match the color while repairing it, and that those repairs would stand out significantly. He said that an ice and water shield is required by code to extend to the edge of the roof.

Mr. McCabe made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for 231 North Stratton Street for the proposed plans depicted in the May 31, 2016 application as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Malot. The motion carried 6-to-0 with 1 abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

B. COA-16-39 Future Stake, Inc. 533 Steinwehr Avenue. Demolition. Demolition of the former Hardee's Restaurant.

Mr. Shaffer gave background information, a brief building history on the structure, and one finding of fact. He said that a sensitive structure is defined as a building over 50 years old and has extra protection; but the Borough ordinance states that buildings less than 50 years old are still reviewed by the Board as a major project and not a critical project. He said that the Historic District was extended on Steinwehr Avenue in 1999. The current building is less is less than 50 years old, and can be reviewed under Parts A and C regarding demolition under the ordinance.

Mr. Sharrah gave a brief presentation and responded to Board questions. He said that there are two lots there that were combined in 1969 between Steinwehr Avenue and Johns Avenue. The original building was constructed in 1970, and has since been rebuilt and used as various restaurant establishments. He said that Mr. Shields, President of Future Stake, Inc., acquired the building in 2014, and that it is in a state of disrepair. He said that the applicant wishes to demolish the building, remove the bituminous asphalt and curbing in the eastern portion of the lot, add topsoil, and enclose the area with a split rail fence to restrict unauthorized use of the property. He said that the asphalt in the back portion of the lot would remain intact. He said that the lot would be maintained until a suitable user is found and the property is redeveloped in conformance with the Borough guidelines. He said that Mr. Shields had been searching for a tenant of the current building since 2014 but to no avail. He stated that Mr. Shield

has a vision for the redevelopment of the property, and has sought concept patterns that coincide with his long-range redevelopment plans.

Mr. Shaffer reviewed the demolition requirements as stated in the ordinance with the Board, not limited to property address, property ownership, pictorial evidence of disrepair. Mr. Sharrah confirmed that this is not demolition by neglect, and that the inside components of the property are beyond financial feasibility for economic return to the applicant, and would be beyond economic return for future tenants. He said that the owner has a future vision for the property that would preclude his interest in selling it. Mr. Sharrah showed drawings by the Planner, Jim Stack, envisioning what the property could look like using concept patterns. Mr. Shaffer stated that the Planning Department provided a letter affirming that the current property is not demolition by neglect. Mr. Malot stated that the building was not altered or neglected, and therefore in compliance with the ordinance. Mr. Shaffer said that the ordinance was rewritten so that if you demolish a building then financial security must be provided to the Borough to ensure that the building is replaced ensuring stabilizing the financial impact of losing a structure. He also stated that if any Board member is unsure about the demolition, then a decision recommending demolition could be delayed for nine months. Mr. Sharrah stated that the applicant intends to maintain and secure the property and keep it looking decent. Mr. Shaffer said that the site does not meet the criteria for preservation, and therefore certain items of the demolition ordinance can be waived, but it is the responsibility of the Board to make a recommendation to Council that the site does not meet the criteria for preservation and can be torn down, but the decision to permit demolition is left to Council.

Ms. Lingle made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the structure at 533 Steinwehr Avenue as depicted in the application dated June 1, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Mr. Goble.

Mr. Shaffer presented the *Proposed Findings of Fact* as part of the discussion:

- The building proposed for demolition does not add to the character of the Historic District;
- The demolition is necessary to allow for a future project to occur that would have substantial public benefit;
- The denial of the demolition would result in an unreasonable hardship for the owner and continuing liability for safety reasons at this site.

The motion carried 7-to-0.

Mr. Shaffer recused himself due to a fiduciary relationship with the next applicant, whereby Mr. Goble assumed the role as chair.

C. **COA-16-36 Jon Berg, 37 North Fourth Street. Alteration. Replace existing wood double doors at the main entry with a single aluminum door and frame with sidelights.**

Mr. Shaffer gave a brief building history and answered Board questions. He stated that the doors are not a minor project, and therefore must come under the review of the Board. He said that the applicant would like to replace the existing wood double doors at the main entry with a single three foot six inch aluminum door and frame with sidelights. He noted that the existing opening will not be enlarged, but only infilled with a custom frame. He said that the door meets the American with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements for accessibility.

Ms. Gustafson made a **motion** that the Board recommend that Borough Council issue a Certificate of Appropriateness 37 North Fourth Street for the proposed plans depicted in the application dated May 25, 2016 as submitted. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion carried 6-to-0 with 1 abstention.

Mr. Shaffer resumed his role as Chair.

Reports

A. Mr. Shaffer presented the Administrative Approvals since the last meeting:

1. **COA-16-34 Russell and Bonnie McCutcheon/Spencer Waldron, 44-46 South Street. Alteration. Repair porch roof with a new rubber roof on flat non-visible area; repair gutters and downspouts.**
2. **COA-16-35 Mike Johnson, 24 Chambersburg Street. Alteration. Replace roof on the fire exit at the rear of the building with in-kind black rubber; replace steps at the fire exit to black metal.**
3. **COA-16-38 Alexander John Zaharias, 336 Baltimore Street. Alteration. Repair gutter and downspout on the front of the house.**

B. Chair Reports

Mr. Shaffer expressed gratitude to Mr. Malot, his staff at PMCA, and Mindy Crawford from Pennsylvania Preservation that there will be a smooth transition and their intent on working with the HARB Board. He reminded the Board to be vigilant regarding buildings in the Historic District falling into disrepair and the potential for demolition by neglect.

Other Business

Satellite Dish Requirements

Susan Naugle presented her findings to the Board regarding the satellite dish ordinance in the Borough's Historic District. She recommended that the Board review the one used by the City of Reading since 2009 to formulate regulations and to craft a workable ordinance to safeguard historic structures in the district.

Mr. Goble made the **motion** that HARB recommend that Borough Council authorize the drafting of an ordinance regulating the use of satellite dishes in the Historic District. The motion was seconded by Ms. Lingle. The motion passed 7-to-0.

Ms. Naugle said that HARB could place this item on the July 25, 2016 Borough Council Workshop session to present ideas to Council.

CLG Training Session

Mr. Shaffer said that there is no report at this time.

Window Survey

Mr. Shaffer said that Ms. Gustafson is currently compiling helpful ideas/steps for refurbing wood windows in historic structures, and make them accessible for public use.

With no other business before the Board, the Board adjourned the meeting at 8:55 PM.

Respectfully submitted,

Karen M. Mesher

Karen M. Mesher
Borough Management Assistant